

PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD

FEBRUARY 7, 2000

3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II

A meeting of the Historic Conservation Board was held this date at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with seven members present: Messrs. Dale, Kreider, Raser and Senhauser and Mmes. Spraul-Schmidt, Sullebarger and Wallace. Members absent: Mr. Bloomfield and Ms. Borys.

MINUTES

The minutes of the January 24, 2000, meeting were approved (motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Dale) as presented.

PRELIMINARY DESIGN REVIEW--1883 MADISON ROAD, EAST WALNUT HILLS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Staff member Caroline Kellam summarized the staff report for the proposed construction of a four-car, one and a half story garage with a breezeway connector to the main house; removal of glass atrium structure and a redwood deck at the rear; replace the deck with a hard surface terrace at grade; general exterior restoration. The proposed garage will be slightly in front of the front plane of the house. Materials for the garage roof and the driveway surface have not yet been determined.

MR. KREIDER JOINED THE MEETING

Project architect Christopher J. Kepes of Architects Plus presented drawings of the proposed improvements and photographs of a similar project Architects Plus completed in 1989. Questions directed to Mr. Kepes and Board discussion followed.

Suggestions made by the Board included:

1. Preserve the front facade of the house and the existing opening pattern by having an L-shaped breezeway with the entrance into the house through alteration of an existing window penetration on the side, even if this requires moving the carriage house/garage back 3'-0" and having a 0'-0" setback from the property line
2. As an alternative, move the breezeway farther from the house and enter through the easternmost window/door opening on the front facade
3. Consider moving the entrance into the garage from the breezeway farther from the lot line
4. Show position of windows on north and east garage elevations
5. Curving driveway that preserves trees and enters from Keys Crescent is a nice treatment.

BOARD ACTION

No action was required by the Board.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AND ZONING VARIANCES FOR IMPROVEMENTS TO THE DOHERTY CAMPUS OF THE SEVEN HILLS SCHOOL, EAST WALNUT HILLS HISTORIC DISTRICT

Staff Member Dan Young summarized the background and staff report on the proposed demolition of a contributing building in a historic district, construction, and landscaping project. He stated that the applicants had addressed the concerns expressed by Board members at the preliminary review at the January 24, 2000, Historic Conservation Board meeting. Mr. Young pointed out that the proposed building could be constructed without zoning variances. This would alter the character of the whole school as perceived from Madison Road and would result in the loss of a playing field integral to the educational establishment.

The school has included neighboring property owners in the planning process for this project. Notices of this hearing were mailed to interested parties. Only the applicants attended the pre-hearing conference. The Historic Conservation Office staff received no phone calls or correspondence on this subject.

C. Francis Barrett, Esq., representing The Seven Hills School, responded to issues raised during the preliminary design review and provided documentation outlining the proposed improvements, justifying demolition of the old Doherty Building. He introduced supporters of the proposal who answered questions from the Board and spoke in favor of granting a Certificate of Appropriateness.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Sullebarger, second by Spraul-Schmidt) to:

1. Find that the denial of the application to demolish Doherty Hall would deny the owner the use of the property in a manner compatible with its organizational purposes and would amount to a taking of the property without just compensation.
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of Doherty Hall on the Doherty Campus of The Seven Hills School in the East Walnut Hills Historic District.
3. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new school building and site improvements at the southeast corner of Madison Road and Johnstone Place in the East Walnut Hills Historic District in accordance with the materials and plans as submitted to the Historic Conservation Board or as subsequently approved by the Urban Conservator and with the variances set forth in Section 5 below.
4. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a parking lot, new planted areas, and play space on the previous site of Doherty Hall on the west side of Johnstone Place in the East Walnut Hills Historic District and with the variances set forth in Section 5 below.
5. Approve the following variances to the Zoning Code, finding that they are necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation so as not to adversely affect the aesthetic integrity of the district and will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety, and welfare or injurious to property in the district or vicinity:

- a. Approval of conditional accessory uses (Section 1407-311 (b) for
 - i. Screen fence for parking area in excess of 6'-0" in height
 - ii. Light Standards for parking area in excess of 6'-0" in height
 - iii. Covered walkway between the new and existing buildings (not attached to either building) in excess of 6'-0" in height
- b. Variance on side yard, Johnstone Place side, of new building:
Required: 21'-0" (Section 1407-400(f)(1) and (2), 1469-243, 1469-251)
Proposed: 13'-8"
- c. Variance on rear yard (Section 1407-400(f)(3)):
Required: 40'-0"
Proposed: 21'-0".

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS & ZONING VARIANCE, 1215-1231
CLAY STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Urban Conservator William Forwood updated the Board on the August 1999 application of Old St. Mary's Church to demolish 1215 and 1217 Clay Street. At that time there was no detailed discussion about what would replace it except that the space would be used for parking. After hearing and reviewing testimony taken at the time and hearing the economic argument for removal of the building and the need for parking on that location, the Board denied a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the building.

Following that, Old St. Mary's appealed that decision to City Council in November 1999. Testimony was taken. Subsequently, Mr. Forwood met twice with Fr. Lauer and Mr. Robert Stephan to explore other ways to address the parking needs and still preserve at least the street facade of the building.

The proposal now before the Board is to remove the rear portion of the building, a commercial addition to what had been originally a residential building; the foundations for the three residential units are still in place. Most of the structural problems previously identified are in the addition; addressing them would account for a great deal of the costs involved in renovating the entire building.

The proposed parking area of lots 1215-1231 would yield approximately 28 parking spaces without variances. If the entire building were demolished, the number of parking spaces would be increased by 10. By permitting demolition of the addition, thus reducing the building to 20'-0" deep by 40'-0" wide with an 800 sq. ft. footprint and approving a zoning variance from the 8'-6" required width of parking spaces, all but two of those parking spaces would be made up. The applicant proposes to mothball the building, stabilize it structurally, maintain and secure it. At some time in the future the space in the retained front portion of the building could be put to another use such as residential caretaker spaces or covered parking.

The current proposal is to demolish only the rear addition to the building, giving the church relief by providing the parking spaces it needs while maintaining the streetscape. In addition, a more detailed plan for the site includes some landscaping and a low brick wall topped by a picket fence (maximum combined height 6'-0") at the front of the site.

A conditional use for parking is approvable under the R-7 Zone when associated with another acceptable use, which the church is. Variances are still necessary for reducing the width of the parking spaces to 8'-0" and for security lighting higher than 6'-0".

Mr. Kreider recused himself from discussion of this item.

Messrs. Robert Stephan and Mike Crushan, representing Old St. Mary's, gave testimony in favor of the proposal.

Sr. Monica McGloin, representing the Over-the-Rhine Community Council and the Over-the-Rhine Community, and Ms. Bonnie Neumeier, Vice President of the Over-the-Rhine Community Council and representing the Peaslee Center, spoke in opposition. Their common concern was the need for affordable housing in the neighborhood.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted (motion by Raser, second by Spraul-Schmidt) five in favor, one abstaining, to:

1. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the one-story, rear addition to 1215-1217 Clay Street, finding that the addition is a non-significant portion of a contributing building and that the demolition of said structure will not adversely affect the streetscape, on the condition that the new rear wall be properly stabilized and infilled and that the building as a whole be secured and maintained weather-tight to prevent further deterioration
2. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the development of 1219-1231 Clay Street and the rear of 1215-1217 Clay Street as a parking lot including the construction of a sidewalk wall/fence, paving and signage as proposed, on the condition that a planting area be added to include an appropriate number of trees at the sidewalk and that final details be approved by the Urban Conservator prior to construction or, if substantial alterations are required, returned to the Board for final approval
3. Approve a Conditional Use for the use of 1219-1231 Clay Street and the rear of 1215-1217 Clay Street as parking, finding that granting such relief
 - (a) Is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation so as not to adversely affect the historic architectural, or aesthetic integrity of the district; and
 - (b) Will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare or injurious to property in the district or vicinity where the property is located on the condition that the new construction meet all City zoning and building codes including Section 1417-309 of the Zoning Code which limits and controls permitted parking uses.
4. Approve Zoning variances to allow for the construction of the plan as proposed including the following:
 - Permit the minimum width of individual parking spaces to be reduced to 8'-0"
 - Permit a light standard mounted above 6'-0".

OTHER BUSINESS

1. The appeal of the Historic Conservation Board's decision granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for 2731 Cleinview Avenue to City Council will be heard in Council Chambers by the City Council Neighborhood and Public Works Committee Tuesday, February 8, 2000, at 1 PM.
2. The Board discussed establishing a review subcommittee to work with applicants for projects with complicated design issues. Mr. Forwood will solicit staff input and suggestions.

MR. DALE LEFT THE MEETING

3. Staff expects a request to the Historic Conservation Board for de-certification of Laurel Homes as a local historic district.
4. The Board discussed the new development proposed for the northwest corner of 6th and Race Streets within the Race Street National Register Historic District. The Board had assisted the Department of Economic Development in creating the district in order to bring historic preservation tax incentives to that neighborhood. The Board expressed concern that recent Economic Development projects had proposed to demolish or insensitively renovate district buildings and agreed to send a letter to the City Manager expressing its concerns.
5. Ms. Spraul-Schmidt reminded the Board that at a previous meeting Board members expressed interest in examining what the Board does and how it does it.

ADJOURNMENT

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned (motion by Raser, second by Spraul-Schmidt).

William L. Forwood
Urban Conservator

John C. Senhauser
Chairman

DATE_____